

To: Land Use and Sustainability Subcommittees serving the Citizens Advisory Committee
From: Arthur Keller & Dan Garber
Date: August 23, 2016
Subject: Draft Performance Measures

We have drafted Performance Metrics policy and program language that the Sustainability and Land Use Subcommittees may find helpful in their discussions. We believe that this language is neutral with respect to the various positions and allows fairly the drafting of development requirements and community livability metrics during the life of the updated Comp Plan. This draft language is below:

Policy L-1.18 Hold new development to the highest standards in order to maintain Palo Alto's livability and achieve the highest quality development with the least impacts. [L33, unchanged]

Program L1.18.1 (development requirements) Create a list of additional development requirements, such as trip reduction, preservation of existing affordable dwelling units, and preservation of tree canopy, to ensure that new development is of the highest quality with the least impacts. [L34, revised]

Program L1.18.2 Update the zoning ordinance to ensure that new development, whether residential or non-residential, conforms with quantitative development standards, neighborhood compatibility standards, and additional development requirements, as well as other new or revised policies elsewhere in this plan. [new program] [Note the explicit reference to Policy L-3.1 regarding neighborhood compatibility.]

Policy L-1.19 (community livability metrics) The city shall monitor key community livability metrics on a regular basis. [L3, revised]

Program L1.19.1 Perform a study of community performance metrics in areas such as greenhouse gas emissions, traffic, jobs, housing, schools, and parks, including best practices by other governments. Create a list of community performance metrics and a schedule for monitoring these metrics. [new program]

Program L1.19.2 Based on trend data gathered over time of the community performance metrics, periodically consider whether to revise downward or upward, retain or eliminate the annual limits on growth and individual area or Citywide cumulative growth caps in the Land Use element. [new program]

DON MCDUGALL SUSTAINABILITY COMMENTS FOR SEPT 6 SUB-COMMITTEE.

DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS OR REQUIREMENTS

POLICY – RETAIN CAP AS DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS PROGRAM IS IMPLEMENTED WITH GOAL OF REMOVING CAP

POLICY – DEVELOPMENT MEASURES ARE NON-NEGOTIABLE – ANTI TO DEVELOP.

POLICY L-1.18 Hold new development to the highest **performance standards** in order to maintain Palo Alto's livability and achieve the highest quality development with the least impacts. **These development standards** are intended to promote sustainability, a high quality of life and ensure that the City consists of well-designed and livable neighborhoods and centers.

Program L1.18.1 Review and refine the existing development standards that address energy, water and other natural resource conservation , parking, open space and parkland, landscaping, tree protection and neighborhood compatibility in Table L-1 to ensure they are effective at achieving the highest quality development with the least impacts.

Program L.1.18.2 Create development requirements that protect livability by addressing these additional topics: reducing trips, preserving and facilitating affordable housing and preservation of the tree canopy.

POLICY L-1.19 (development performance measures) In addition to conforming with building design and other policies within this element, new market rate development, whether residential or non-residential, shall conform with the development performance measures established as policies elsewhere in this plan. Collectively, these policies are intended to promote sustainability and ensure that the City consists of well-designed and livable neighborhoods and centers.

COMMUNITY MEASURES

POLICY L-1.20 (community performance measures) The City will monitor key community livability indicators on a regular basis to determine whether the policies of this plan and the efforts of the Palo Alto residents and businesses are effective at promoting livability by using community performance measures. Suggested measures and monitoring frequency are listed in Table L-2 related to greenhouse gas emissions, vehicle miles traveled, commute trips by single occupant vehicle, jobs/housing balance, and community diversity.

1. PROGRAM COLLECT DATA OF ALL TYPES

2. PROGRAM DECIDE MEASURES – SOME PREDICTIVE, SOME CURRENT, SOME HISTORICAL SOME 1 YEAR SOME MORE.

Program L-1.20.1 Develop community performance measures for topics such as greenhouse gas emissions, transportation, jobs, housing, schools, parks and diversity. Create a list of community performance measures and a schedule for monitoring these measures (new program).

3. PROGRAM REPORT MEASURES TO PUBLIC - TRANSPARENCY

POLICY REVISE DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS POLICIES AND PROGRAMS

Program L-1.20.2 Based on monitoring the community performance measures data over time, periodically consider whether to retain, revise downward or upward or eliminate the annual limits on growth and the individual area and Citywide cumulative growth caps in this Land Use Element.

WHEN ASAP, 15 YEARS?

TABLE L-1 DEVELOPMENT PERFORMANCE MEASURES (AUGUST 16, 2016 VERSION)

DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS OR REQUIREMENTS

These measures are new tools strongly focused on protecting livability.

1. **Reducing Trips: a specific percent of typical SOV commuter trips.**
2. **Preserving Affordable Housing: no net loss of affordable dwelling units and discouraging loss of smaller homes such as cottages.**
3. **Facilitating Affordable Housing: Allow flexible height limits to facilitate a mix of multi-family housing, including affordable units, micro-units and housing for seniors and people with special needs.**
4. **Protecting Nature in the City: preserving** **or increasing natural ground cover, including the canopy, or a percent landscaped/open space areas.**
5. **Green Building: Conserving energy, water, and resources through meeting specific requirements in the City’s mandatory green building ordinance. It covers:**
 - Energy Efficiency and
 - Green Building
 - Construction Waste, Reduction, Disposal and Recycling
 - Light Pollution Reduction
 - Electric Vehicle
 - Materials
 - Bicycle Parking
 - Charging
 - Impermeable Surface Area For Groundwater Recharge
 - Native, Drought
 - Tolerant Planting
 - Indoor Air Quality
6. **Parking: Meeting need without providing excess:** **Parking** **Vehicle**
 Parking
7. **Neighborhood compatibility: Avoiding negative impacts and improving the surroundings:** **Glare** **Noise** **Shade**

DEVELOPMENT BONUSSES

1. **Parkland: Providing common open space and contributing to Citywide park need:**
 - Provision of parkland or payment of fees
 - Private open space
2. **Landscaping and Amenities: Making Palo Alto more beautiful:** **Tree protection**
 and retention **Public Art**
3. **LOS – no increase in congestion**
4. **NO displacement of existing BMR residents**
5. **“native plantings” in addition to urban forest, open space, and habitat**
6. **NO parking overflow/spillover to public streets/surrounding neighborhoods**

7. NO loss of low-cost office space

8. Delete measure regarding allowing flexible height limits

Add all the items listed under Existing Development Standards in Table L-1 back into the Development Performance Measures section

TABLE L-2 COMMUNITY PERFORMANCE MEASURES (AUGUST 16TH VERSION)

Measure Target Recommended Monitoring Frequency

1. Greenhouse Gas Emissions REDUCE to 80% below 1990 emissions by 2030 (S/CAP goal)
Annually Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) per Capita REDUCE by 5% per year Every 4 years.
2. Percent of Commute Trips to Employment Centers by SOV REDUCE to 40% below ITE standards for Downtown and 30% below ITE standards for SRP. Annually
3. Jobs/Housing Balance (Expressed as a Ratio of Jobs to Employed Residents) IMPROVE existing ratio to decrease existing jobs/housing imbalance Every 4 years
4. Housing Cost Burden REDUCE percentage of owners and renters paying more than 50% of household income for housing Every 4 years, consistent with State required Housing Element cycle
5. Affordable Housing Stock INCREASE supply of housing affordable to moderate-income, lowincome, and very-low-income households Every 4 years, consistent with State required Housing Element cycle Community Diversity MAINTAIN similar proportions as the levels documented in 2015 [see Fig. 2-3 in adopted 2015 HE] Every 4 years, consistent with State required Housing Element cycle
6. PAUSD Spending per Student MAINTAIN or IMPROVE 2015-2016 levels Annually
7. PAUSD Class Size MAINTAIN or IMPROVE 2015-2016 class size Annually
8. Park Acreage per Capita MAINTAIN or IMPROVE existing ratio of district and neighborhood parks Every 4 years Additional/ Revised Community Performance Measures Proposed by CAC members (Table L12) • Add reduction in LOS Page | 5 •
9. Add corridor travel times
10. Replace PAUSD student spending and class size metrics with the results of the annual Strategic Plan Survey's assessment of satisfaction with schools.
11. Index PAUSD spending per student metric to an inflation metric
12. Use the performance measures to show the integration of the Comp Plan and the S/CAP
13. There are an unmanageable number of measures. Should be no more than five.
14. Diversity is important, but income diversity metric is not appropriate: existing household income ratios should not be maintained, and we should not/cannot enforce economic diversity. Measuring income is too invasive.
15. Jobs/housing balance is not an appropriate metrics; could lead to too much residential growth.
16. Add parking overflow into neighborhoods

17. Add increase in urban canopy