



COMPREHENSIVE PLAN UPDATE CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE SUSTAINABILITY SUBCOMMITTEE AGENDA

Tuesday, September 6, 2016

Palo Alto City Hall
Flexible Meeting Room, Ground Floor
1:00 PM TO 3:00 PM

TITLE: CAC Sustainability Subcommittee Discussion – Land Use and Community Design Element Performance Measures
FROM: Elena Lee, Interim Planning Manager, Planning & Community Environment Department

At the conclusion of the August 16 CAC meeting to discuss the Draft Land Use and Community Design Element, the group decided that both the Sustainability subcommittee and the Land Use subcommittee should meet again to discuss issues identified at the meeting and return to the full CAC with options and/or recommendations. The Sustainability subcommittee is being asked to work on the performance measures. At the full CAC meeting, we heard two general categories of comment on the performance measures in the current Draft Element.

- A. In the Land Use Element, articulate the purpose(s) the performance measures are intended to achieve and the topics the performance measures should address. Create the performance measures through a future, dedicated process, and remove the specificity in the current draft in favor of a program that directs the City to create the performance measures, or
- B. Add more detail and specificity to the performance measures.

Options that respond to each of these categories are presented below. The subcommittee should review and suggest any changes to these options before they are brought to the full CAC at the September 20 meeting.

Future Program

Following the August 16 CAC meeting, staff attempted to synthesize the feedback from CAC members who supported the idea of taking specifics out of the Comp Plan. Performance Standards would be developed during the implementation of the Comp Plan. The August 16th packet, including the original draft element, is available at this location: [http://www.paloaltocompplan.org/cac/citizens-advisory-committee/#August 16, 2016](http://www.paloaltocompplan.org/cac/citizens-advisory-committee/#August%2016,%202016). The proposed revised policies and programs on performance measures would be:

Policy L-1.18 Hold new development to the highest performance standards in order to maintain Palo Alto's livability and achieve the highest quality development with the least impacts. These development standards are intended to promote sustainability, a high quality of life and ensure that the City consists of well-designed and livable neighborhoods and centers.

Program L1.18.1 Review and refine the existing development standards that address energy, water and other natural resource conservation , parking, open space and parkland, landscaping, tree protection and neighborhood compatibility in Table L-1 to ensure they are effective at achieving the highest quality development with the least impacts.

Program L.1.18.2 Create development requirements that protect livability by addressing these additional topics: reducing trips, preserving and facilitating affordable housing and preservation of the tree canopy.

~~Policy L-1.19 (development performance measures) In addition to conforming with building design and other policies within this element, new market rate development, whether residential or non-residential, shall conform with the development performance measures established as policies elsewhere in this plan. Collectively, these policies are intended to promote sustainability and ensure that the City consists of well-designed and livable neighborhoods and centers.~~

~~Policy L-1.20 (community performance measures) The City will monitor key community livability indicators on a regular basis to determine whether the policies of this plan and the efforts of the Palo Alto residents and businesses are effective at promoting livability by using community performance measures. Suggested measures and monitoring frequency are listed in Table L-2 related to greenhouse gas emissions, vehicle miles traveled, commute trips by single occupant vehicle, jobs/housing balance, and community diversity.~~

Program L-1.20.1 Develop community performance measures for topics such as greenhouse gas emissions, transportation, jobs, housing, schools, parks and diversity. Create a list of community performance measures and a schedule for monitoring these measures (new program).

Program L-1.20.2 Based on monitoring the community performance measures data over time, periodically consider whether to retain, revise downward or upward or eliminate the annual limits on growth and the individual area and Citywide cumulative growth caps in this Land Use Element.

Also attached are suggested policy/program wording changes by CAC members that also address this approach of deferring development of the performance standards.

Additional Specificity

Some CAC members suggested that additional performance measures should be added to the lists in the Draft Element, which were presented in two tables. The additional measures are provided below each table as shown in the August 16th Draft Element for subcommittee discussion and consideration.

TABLE L-1 DEVELOPMENT PERFORMANCE MEASURES (AUGUST 16, 2016 VERSION)

These measures are new tools strongly focused on protecting livability.

1. **Reducing Trips:** *a specific percent of typical SOV commuter trips.*
2. **Preserving Affordable Housing:** *no net loss of affordable dwelling units and discouraging loss of smaller homes such as cottages.*
3. **Facilitating Affordable Housing:** *Allow flexible height limits to facilitate a mix of multi-family housing, including affordable units, micro-units and housing for seniors and people with special needs.*
4. **Protecting Nature in the City:** *preserving or increasing natural ground cover, including the canopy, or a percent landscaped/open space areas.*

EXISTING DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS

The City already regulates many aspects of development. The City will review these existing regulations to ensure they are consistent with current targets and effective in achieving the highest quality development with the least impacts.

- **Green Building:** *Conserving energy, water, and resources through meeting specific requirements in the City's mandatory green building ordinance. It covers:*
 - Energy Efficiency and Conservation*
 - Materials and Waste*
 - Construction Waste, Reduction, Disposal and Recycling*
 - Green Building Materials*
 - Light Pollution Reduction*
 - Emissions*
 - Electric Vehicle Charging*
 - Bicycle Parking*
 - Water Efficiency, Conservation, and Reuse*
 - Impermeable Surface Area For Groundwater Recharge*
 - Native, Drought-Tolerant Planting*
 - Indoor Air Quality*
- **Parking:** *Meeting need without providing excess:*
 - Bike Parking*
 - Vehicle Parking*
- **Parkland:** *Providing common open space and contributing to Citywide park need:*
 - Provision of parkland or payment of fees*
 - Private open space*
- **Landscaping and Amenities:** *Making Palo Alto more beautiful:*
 - Tree protection and retention*
 - Public Art*
- **Neighborhood compatibility:** *Avoiding negative impacts and improving the surroundings:*
 - Glare*
 - Noise*
 - Shade*
 - Utility Undergrounding*

Additional Development Performance Measures Proposed by CAC Members (Table L-1 – green sidebar in Draft Element)

- Add LOS – no increase in congestion
- Add displacement of existing BMR residents
- Add “native plantings” in addition to urban forest, open space, and habitat
- Add no parking overflow/spillover to public streets/surrounding neighborhoods
- Add loss of low-cost office space
- Delete measure regarding allowing flexible height limits
- Add all the items listed under Existing Development Standards in Table L-1 back into the Development Performance Measures section

TABLE L-2 COMMUNITY PERFORMANCE MEASURES (AUGUST 16TH VERSION)		
Measure	Target	Recommended Monitoring Frequency
Greenhouse Gas Emissions	REDUCE to 80% below 1990 emissions by 2030 (S/CAP goal)	Annually
Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) per Capita	REDUCE by 5% per year	Every 4 years
Percent of Commute Trips to Employment Centers by SOV	REDUCE to 40% below ITE standards for Downtown and 30% below ITE standards for SRP.	Annually
Jobs/Housing Balance (Expressed as a Ratio of Jobs to Employed Residents)	IMPROVE existing ratio to decrease existing jobs/housing imbalance	Every 4 years
Housing Cost Burden	REDUCE percentage of owners and renters paying more than 50% of household income for housing	Every 4 years, consistent with State required Housing Element cycle
Affordable Housing Stock	INCREASE supply of housing affordable to moderate-income, low-income, and very-low-income households	Every 4 years, consistent with State required Housing Element cycle
Community Diversity	MAINTAIN similar proportions as the levels documented in 2015 [see Fig. 2-3 in adopted 2015 HE]	Every 4 years, consistent with State required Housing Element cycle
PAUSD Spending per Student	MAINTAIN or IMPROVE 2015-2016 levels	Annually
PAUSD Class Size	MAINTAIN or IMPROVE 2015-2016 class size	Annually
Park Acreage per Capita	MAINTAIN or IMPROVE existing ratio of district and neighborhood parks	Every 4 years

Additional/ Revised Community Performance Measures Proposed by CAC members (Table L-2)

- Add reduction in LOS

- Add corridor travel times
- Replace PAUSD student spending and class size metrics with the results of the annual Strategic Plan Survey's assessment of satisfaction with schools.
- Index PAUSD spending per student metric to an inflation metric
- Use the performance measures to show the integration of the Comp Plan and the S/CAP
- There are an unmanageable number of measures. Should be no more than five.
- Diversity is important, but income diversity metric is not appropriate: existing household income ratios should not be maintained, and we should not/cannot enforce economic diversity. Measuring income is too invasive.
- Jobs/housing balance is not an appropriate metrics; could lead to too much residential growth.
- Add parking overflow into neighborhoods
- Add increase in urban canopy

Attachments

Attachment A: CAC comment

Attachment B: August 16 Draft Land Use Element (Clean copy) (CAC subcommittee members only.

Electronic copy available at: <http://www.paloaltocompplan.org/cac/citizens-advisory-committee>)

To: Land Use and Sustainability Subcommittees serving the Citizens Advisory Committee

From: Arthur Keller & Dan Garber

Date: August 23, 2016

Subject: Draft Performance Measures

We have drafted Performance Metrics policy and program language that the Sustainability and Land Use Subcommittees may find helpful in their discussions. We believe that this language is neutral with respect to the various positions and allows fairly the drafting of development requirements and community livability metrics during the life of the updated Comp Plan. This draft language is below:

Policy L-1.18 Hold new development to the highest standards in order to maintain Palo Alto's livability and achieve the highest quality development with the least impacts. [L33, unchanged]

Program L1.18.1 (development requirements) Create a list of additional development requirements, such as trip reduction, preservation of existing affordable dwelling units, and preservation of tree canopy, to ensure that new development is of the highest quality with the least impacts. [L34, revised]

Program L1.18.2 Update the zoning ordinance to ensure that new development, whether residential or non-residential, conforms with quantitative development standards, neighborhood compatibility standards, and additional development requirements, as well as other new or revised policies elsewhere in this plan. [new program] [Note the explicit reference to Policy L-3.1 regarding neighborhood compatibility.]

Policy L-1.19 (community livability metrics) The city shall monitor key community livability metrics on a regular basis. [L3, revised]

Program L1.19.1 Perform a study of community performance metrics in areas such as greenhouse gas emissions, traffic, jobs, housing, schools, and parks, including best practices by other governments. Create a list of community performance metrics and a schedule for monitoring these metrics. [new program]

Program L1.19.2 Based on trend data gathered over time of the community performance metrics, periodically consider whether to revise downward or upward, retain or eliminate the annual limits on growth and individual area or Citywide cumulative growth caps in the Land Use element. [new program]