



**COMPREHENSIVE PLAN UPDATE
CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE
AT PLACES MEMO
Tuesday, October 18, 2016**

The following documents are attached for your review and information:

1. CAC member Hamilton Hitching's comments
2. CAC member comments Bonnie Packer's comments
3. CAC member Annette Glanckopf's comments

Comments from CAC Member Hamilton Hitchings

Safety Element

- Much of what has been added to the Safety Element is just to bring it up-to-date with what the public safety city staff are already pursuing to enhance public safety.
- S1.1.1 add “food and” to water, although water is more important to public’s need to store emergency supplies to be self sufficient for one week.
- S1.6.3 New Program: The Public Safety Building will be resilient to possible natural and human threats including earthquakes, terrorism and fire. This includes remaining safe to occupy and fully functional after a major earthquake. The Public Safety Building will also be designed to withstand and protect its staff from common terrorist attacks including car bombs, assault rifles and molotov cocktails. Evaluate other nearby new Public Safety Buildings to adopt their best design practices. Include at least one week of emergency water and food for staff.
- I like the new section on Cyber Security, however, program S4.7.2 is designed to establish criteria for maximum security of telecommunication technology in large-scale commercial and business projects, my feeling is that private industry is generally more knowledgeable and leading the public sector in this field so I lack the context to understand how this could be effective. However, if we replaced “commercial and business development projects” with “government, medical and educational facilities” then it would make sense. I'd like to hear staff's thinking behind this.
- New Program S4.9.2 Provide long-term emergency power source (e.g. solar) to augment short-term power generators for the Public Safety Building and Fire Stations. For example, use the solar on top of new garage next to Public Safety Building for its emergency power.
- For 100 year flood protection, add a section that we want to do it in an environmental friendly manner that minimizes removal of trees.
- New Program Community Safety: Require all on-duty city police to wear working body cameras and have their recordings preserved and available to both the prosecution and defense for court cases. - This suggested program was not included but I feel it should be for the good of the community.

Natural Element

- Sometimes local generated solar is more expensive but allows our electric grid to be more resilient so in this specific case I feel that we should relax the lowest cost requirement.
- I don’t understand why having a carbon free building requirement by 2025 hurts our urban canopy and therefore there is a recommendation to remove that requirement? Please explain?
- Why was Program N5.1.3 promotion of alternate fuels and electric plugins in parking facilities removed?
- In policy N6.1 why was “maximum outdoor noise levels” weakened to “normal acceptable” noise levels? Could “in residential neighborhoods be added”

Process

- Why does the PTC get to review and provide final recommendations? First, the PTC chair is part of the CAC and second it seems like a bit of end-run around the CAC process. I’d like the July and August PTC review removed from the calendar.

Comments from CAC Member Bonnie Packer's on Natural Environment Element – October 18, 2016

- **Introduction** assumes the Safety Element is part of the Natural Environment Element, but I understand that Safety will be a stand-alone element.
- **General:** In both the Air Quality and Noise Goals, I would like to add programs addressing the use of gas powered garden appliances such as mowers and blowers. So many of my comments relate to that issue.
- **Air Quality**
- Program N5.2.I Provide examples, such as TDM programs.
- Policy N5.3 and Program N5.3.2: Add gas powered gardening appliances such as mowers and blowers. Or add new Policy N5.6 as described below.
- Policy N5.4 Add language in the beginning: “Ensure through effective regulation that “...all potential sources of odor and/or toxic air contaminants should be
- adequately buffered, or mechanically or otherwise mitigated to avoid odor and
- toxic impacts that violate relevant human health standards. [Previous Policy
- N-29] [N14]
- Add Policy N5.6: Reduce air pollution and airborne dust by discouraging the use of landscaping/gardening leaf blowers.
- Add Programs under this Policy :
 - 1. Provide homeowners and gardening/landscaping businesses with information regarding the many benefits of using a rake (blowers - gas or electric - add particulates to the air) and using electric powered mowers. Promote this change of behavior through incentives and education. (improve air quality and get more exercise!)
 - 2. Promote and encourage through incentives environment - friendly practices for maintaining residential and business landscapes. (i.e., leave the leaves on the ground to compost, rather than blow them away.)
- **Noise:** Suggest using separate subheadings for Exterior and Interior Noise
- Suggest using Policy N5.3 as a model for the introductory policy for Noise (external): Reduce sources of external noise from manufacturing, construction activity, and gardening appliances, and other sources through education and regulation, to the extent allowed by law. That is: add the concept of education to these policies – not just regulation.
- Policy N6.1: the narratives under this seem out of place. Can this level of detail be referred to in another document?
- Program 6.4.1, refers to exterior noise and it would be better as a policy in the sections that deal with exterior noise. And this policy should be divided into two policies. Programs 4.2, 4.3, can stay as programs under this policy.

- Add a policy or program to reduce noise over a certain dB level from gardening appliances such as mowers and blowers, chain saws, tree trimmers and tree chippers, etc.
- **Transportation Roadway Noise.** Add “encourage the use of electric powered vehicles” (these are quieter) What about motorcycles and bad mufflers? Seems like there must be more that we can add to Roadway Noise
- Policy N6.8 seems redundant as this issue is covered in Policy N6.4
- **Energy:** In general, this section needs to be streamlined. There seems to be a lot of repetition and overlap.
- Policy N7.9 has two different ideas and should be two separate policies.
- **Safety:** This element could use a lot of streamlining.
- Should residents be advised to also store food for a week after an emergency?
- **Earthquakes:** Program S2.3. 1 Add private schools and non-profit orgs here – such as YMCA, Abilities United, Avenidas etc. All non-profits which have buildings to which clients come for services should have earthquake preparedness activities. Also hospitals and medical facilities.
- Program S2.5.3 about TDRs – this needs more explanation as to why it is here.
- Program S2.5.4. Change last line to “owners of subsidized housing for lower income residents.” (senior housing may inadvertently include upscale retirement homes)
- **Floods:** Policy S2.8 re improving bay levees. Is it appropriate to mention SAFER Bay Project here? Do we want to encourage the use of horizontal levees with habitat transition zones as being proposed by SAFER Bay project?
- **Hazardous materials:** In addition to haz mat being carried on freight trains, should there be a program regarding trucks carrying these materials – or is this already regulated by the state?
- **Infrastructure: Water:** Should there be a mention of encouraging drought tolerant plants and landscaping? This would mean less water use and thus better water management during droughts. Would a similar idea be appropriate in the Drought Section?
- **Solid waste:** This section has a lot of duplications in it. Needs streamlining.
- Program S4.2.3. Residents are already encouraged to put food waste into the yard waste bins.
- Policy S4.4 We should also support efforts to encourage the creators of consumer goods to manufacture and package products so that they do not create so much waste for the consumer to get rid of. That is, the burden of reducing waste should shift to the makers of the products.
- **Telecommunications and Cybersecurity:** Is “Telecommunications” the correct word, or should a broader term be used such as “Information Technology”?

Comments from CAC Member Annette Glanckopf

Safety Element Comments CAC

October 18, 2016

Public Awareness

Add program: Implement an annual Palo Alto City Wide Eprep faire and sell eprep supplies including water at reduced rates

Community Safety

Under Policy S1.2: Program to Develop marketing materials to encourage awareness of crime safety featuring the block preparedness coordinator program role which includes neighborhood watch

Under Program S1.3.1: Add Human Relations Commission

Under Policy s1.4 and Program s1.4.1 replace "Neighborhood Organizations" with "residents"

Under Policy S 1 and Program s1,4,2. Remove Palo Alto Library add to "community safety" **and emergency preparedness** "education "

In this general area work with regularly review enhance: Who does this? It would be better to be more specific

Add Policy: Resilient infrastructure and structures should be designed to protect the life and safety of the public, minimize economic loss, and maintain availability and continued use of infrastructure services.

Program 1. Decentralize, as necessary, new infrastructure so as to minimize the impacts of climate change. For example, waste treatment for new buildings can be done on site to minimize load on the wastewater treatment plant as well as to mitigate effects of sea level rise on the centralized system; microgrids can be the main power source during power outages due to extreme weather events or manmade failures.

Program 2: Prohibit unnecessary underground construction in areas in which the current groundwater level is 14 feet or less to accommodate expected higher groundwater levels due to sea level rise and minimize consequent flooding of underground construction.

Program 3. Require all construction projects to determine and pay for the total carbon costs of the project in order to incentivize reducing the production of green house gases

Natural Hazards

Under Policy s2.3 Program S2.3.1 Change Strengthen to Collaborate with PAUSD to Implement...(why just mention earthquakes? The need is for all forms of emergency preparedness)

Flood Hazards and Mitigation: Redundancy with Policy S2,7 and 9

Policy S2.10: redundant to other programs and policies

Under drought add

Climate Change

Policy: All City programs and plans shall take into account expected changes and impacts due to climate change and include enough variability in the plans to accommodate a wide variety of potential outcomes. These changes include, but are not limited to, extended droughts, severe storms, floods, less water as snowpack from the Sierras, sea level rise, groundwater inundation, extreme temperatures and increase in wildfires.

Program 1: Review and update zoning and other policies to account for the effects of climate change.

Program 2. Develop a carbon cost equivalency for all processes, materials and equipment used in construction. This carbon cost shall be considered in the granting of building permits and in

the green certification program. (For example, depending on the type of cement used, production of 1 ton of cement produces about 1 ton of greenhouse gases. A federal appeals court recently ruled that a cost of \$36 can be ascribed to 1 ton of greenhouse gases. Stanford claims the cost is actually higher, \$220/ton of GHG but the lower number is a start to costing the effects of construction and other processes on global warming).

Program 3. Plans to mitigate for climate change shall include aquifer storage and recovery, floodplain and stream restoration, flood diversion and storage, and green infrastructure methods.

Fire Protection and Awareness

Need to renumber . There always are policies with these numbers
Under this numbering Policy s2.5 needs a program

Infrastructure

Under water supply and safety add

Water Policy: Plan for water scarcity due to climate change and added demand for water due to population growth by regulating all groundwater use.

Program 1. All groundwater extracted must be metered and charged at market rates.

Program 2. All uncontaminated (does not contain toxic chemicals) groundwater extracted must be used for the benefit of the community. This includes irrigation of parks, streetscape, etc., street cleaning, dust suppression, fire-fighting, etc.

Program 3. De minimis (1(?) million gallons or less) groundwater extracted may be recharged to the aquifer via onsite percolation.

Stormwater management : Look at numbering....Policy S4.7 is followed by S4.1 ??

Telecommunications & Cyber security

Program S4.8.2 after public safety responders add ESVs (Emergency Service Volunteers)

Comments from CAC Member Annette Glanckopf

Natural Environment Comments CAC October 18, 2016

Air Quality

Policy N5.2 **reword** Encourage single occupant vehicle trips and other behaviors to reduce emission from cars.... Too much like big brother

Noise 6.1

Policy N6,1 Too much detail, some of this should be zoning...not comp plan

Policy N6.4: Again too much detail for comp plan. These should be ARB and IR guidelines

Policy N6.4 Program N6.4.4 another program Increase code enforcement and penalties for violations

Transportation- Rail 6.4

Do not agree with Program N6.7.2 re quiet zones. Until we have grade separation, beeping is necessary esp in school zones. I think the duration of noise can be reduced.

Construction Noise 6.5

Code enforcement needs to be enhanced with stronger penalties for violations esp hours of operations

Energy 7

Policy N7.11 Program N7.11.1 This concerns me again big brotherish, Until the cost of gas is comparable to electric most people will not switch. I would also like to point out, that cooking with gas is better than with electric.

Climate change and adaption 8

Need to add policy and programs to encourage residents and businesses to install solar...bulk discounts etc

Note The dewatering group informed council that dewatering adds to sea level rise add

Policy: Mitigate the effects of climate change on the Natural Environment

Program 1. Protect our City's groundwater as a hedge against salt water intrusion due to sea level rise.

Program 2. To minimize floods in areas with high groundwater levels, avoid removal of water retaining soils due to underground construction.

Program 3. Minimize coastal erosion due to sea level rise by protecting our wetlands.

Comments from CAC Member Hamilton Hitchings

Safety Element

- Much of what has been added to the Safety Element is just to bring it up-to-date with what the public safety city staff are already pursuing to enhance public safety.
- S1.1.1 add “food and” to water, although water is more important to public’s need to store emergency supplies to be self sufficient for one week.
- S1.6.3 New Program: The Public Safety Building will be resilient to possible natural and human threats including earthquakes, terrorism and fire. This includes remaining safe to occupy and fully functional after a major earthquake. The Public Safety Building will also be designed to withstand and protect its staff from common terrorist attacks including car bombs, assault rifles and molotov cocktails. Evaluate other nearby new Public Safety Buildings to adopt their best design practices. Include at least one week of emergency water and food for staff.
- I like the new section on Cyber Security, however, program S4.7.2 is designed to establish criteria for maximum security of telecommunication technology in large-scale commercial and business projects, my feeling is that private industry is generally more knowledgeable and leading the public sector in this field so I lack the context to understand how this could be effective. However, if we replaced “commercial and business development projects” with “government, medical and educational facilities” then it would make sense. I'd like to hear staff's thinking behind this.
- New Program S4.9.2 Provide long-term emergency power source (e.g. solar) to augment short-term power generators for the Public Safety Building and Fire Stations. For example, use the solar on top of new garage next to Public Safety Building for its emergency power.
- For 100 year flood protection, add a section that we want to do it in an environmental friendly manner that minimizes removal of trees.
- New Program Community Safety: Require all on-duty city police to wear working body cameras and have their recordings preserved and available to both the prosecution and defense for court cases. - This suggested program was not included but I feel it should be for the good of the community.

Natural Element

- Sometimes local generated solar is more expensive but allows our electric grid to be more resilient so in this specific case I feel that we should relax the lowest cost requirement.
- I don't understand why having a carbon free building requirement by 2025 hurts our urban canopy and therefore there is a recommendation to remove that requirement? Please explain?
- Why was Program N5.1.3 promotion of alternate fuels and electric plugins in parking facilities removed?
- In policy N6.1 why was “maximum outdoor noise levels” weakened to “normal acceptable” noise levels? Could “in residential neighborhoods be added”

Process

- Why does the PTC get to review and provide final recommendations? First, the PTC chair is part of the CAC and second it seems like a bit of end-run around the CAC process. I'd like the July and August PTC review removed from the calendar.

Comments from CAC Member Bonnie Packer's on Natural Environment Element – October 18, 2016

- **Introduction** assumes the Safety Element is part of the Natural Environment Element, but I understand that Safety will be a stand-alone element.
- **General:** In both the Air Quality and Noise Goals, I would like to add programs addressing the use of gas powered garden appliances such as mowers and blowers. So many of my comments relate to that issue.
- **Air Quality**
- Program N5.2.I Provide examples, such as TDM programs.
- Policy N5.3 and Program N5.3.2: Add gas powered gardening appliances such as mowers and blowers. Or add new Policy N5.6 as described below.
- Policy N5.4 Add language in the beginning: “Ensure through effective regulation that “....all potential sources of odor and/or toxic air contaminants should be
- adequately buffered, or mechanically or otherwise mitigated to avoid odor and
- toxic impacts that violate relevant human health standards. [Previous Policy
- N-29] [N14]
- Add Policy N5.6: Reduce air pollution and airborne dust by discouraging the use of landscaping/gardening leaf blowers.
- Add Programs under this Policy :
- 1. Provide homeowners and gardening/landscaping businesses with information regarding the many benefits of using a rake (blowers - gas or electric - add particulates to the air) and using electric powered mowers. Promote this change of behavior through incentives and education. (improve air quality and get more exercise!)
- 2. Promote and encourage through incentives environment - friendly practices for maintaining residential and business landscapes. (i.e., leave the leaves on the ground to compost, rather than blow them away.)
- **Noise:** Suggest using separate subheadings for Exterior and Interior Noise
- Suggest using Policy N5.3 as a model for the introductory policy for Noise (external): Reduce sources of external noise from manufacturing, construction activity, and gardening appliances, and other sources through education and regulation, to the extent allowed by law. That is: add the concept of education to these policies – not just regulation.
- Policy N6.1: the narratives under this seem out of place. Can this level of detail be referred to in another document?
- Program 6.4.1, refers to exterior noise and it would be better as a policy in the sections that deal with exterior noise. And this policy should be divided into two policies. Programs 4.2, 4.3, can stay as programs under this policy.

- Add a policy or program to reduce noise over a certain dB level from gardening appliances such as mowers and blowers, chain saws, tree trimmers and tree chippers, etc.
- **Transportation Roadway Noise.** Add “encourage the use of electric powered vehicles” (these are quieter) What about motorcycles and bad mufflers? Seems like there must be more that we can add to Roadway Noise
- Policy N6.8 seems redundant as this issue is covered in Policy N6.4
- **Energy:** In general, this section needs to be streamlined. There seems to be a lot of repetition and overlap.
- Policy N7.9 has two different ideas and should be two separate policies.
- **Safety:** This element could use a lot of streamlining.
- Should residents be advised to also store food for a week after an emergency?
- **Earthquakes:** Program S2.3. 1 Add private schools and non-profit orgs here – such as YMCA, Abilities United, Avenidas etc. All non-profits which have buildings to which clients come for services should have earthquake preparedness activities. Also hospitals and medical facilities.
- Program S2.5.3 about TDRs – this needs more explanation as to why it is here.
- Program S2.5.4. Change last line to “owners of subsidized housing for lower income residents.” (senior housing may inadvertently include upscale retirement homes)
- **Floods:** Policy S2.8 re improving bay levees. Is it appropriate to mention SAFER Bay Project here? Do we want to encourage the use of horizontal levees with habitat transition zones as being proposed by SAFER Bay project?
- **Hazardous materials:** In addition to haz mat being carried on freight trains, should there be a program regarding trucks carrying these materials – or is this already regulated by the state?
- **Infrastructure: Water:** Should there be a mention of encouraging drought tolerant plants and landscaping? This would mean less water use and thus better water management during droughts. Would a similar idea be appropriate in the Drought Section?
- **Solid waste:** This section has a lot of duplications in it. Needs streamlining.
- Program S4.2.3. Residents are already encouraged to put food waste into the yard waste bins.
- Policy S4.4 We should also support efforts to encourage the creators of consumer goods to manufacture and package products so that they do not create so much waste for the consumer to get rid of. That is, the burden of reducing waste should shift to the makers of the products.
- **Telecommunications and Cybersecurity:** Is “Telecommunications” the correct word, or should a broader term be used such as “Information Technology”?

Comments from CAC Member Annette Glanckopf

Safety Element Comments CAC

October 18, 2016

Public Awareness

Add program: Implement an annual Palo Alto City Wide Eprep faire and sell eprep supplies including water at reduced rates

Community Safety

Under Policy S1.2: Program to Develop marketing materials to encourage awareness of crime safety featuring the block preparedness coordinator program role which includes neighborhood watch

Under Program S1.3.1: Add Human Relations Commission

Under Policy s1.4 and Program s1.4.1 replace "Neighborhood Organizations" with "residents"

Under Policy S 1 and Program s1,4,2. Remove Palo Alto Library add to "community safety" **and emergency preparedness** "education "

In this general area work with regularly review enhance: Who does this? It would be better to be more specific

Add Policy: Resilient infrastructure and structures should be designed to protect the life and safety of the public, minimize economic loss, and maintain availability and continued use of infrastructure services.

Program 1. Decentralize, as necessary, new infrastructure so as to minimize the impacts of climate change. For example, waste treatment for new buildings can be done on site to minimize load on the wastewater treatment plant as well as to mitigate effects of sea level rise on the centralized system; microgrids can be the main power source during power outages due to extreme weather events or manmade failures.

Program 2: Prohibit unnecessary underground construction in areas in which the current groundwater level is 14 feet or less to accommodate expected higher groundwater levels due to sea level rise and minimize consequent flooding of underground construction.

Program 3. Require all construction projects to determine and pay for the total carbon costs of the project in order to incentivize reducing the production of green house gases

Natural Hazards

Under Policy s2.3 Program S2.3.1 Change Strengthen to Collaborate with PAUSD to Implement...(why just mention earthquakes? The need is for all forms of emergency preparedness)

Flood Hazards and Mitigation: Redundancy with Policy S2,7 and 9

Policy S2.10: redundant to other programs and policies

Under drought add

Climate Change

Policy: All City programs and plans shall take into account expected changes and impacts due to climate change and include enough variability in the plans to accommodate a wide variety of potential outcomes. These changes include, but are not limited to, extended droughts, severe storms, floods, less water as snowpack from the Sierras, sea level rise, groundwater inundation, extreme temperatures and increase in wildfires.

Program 1: Review and update zoning and other policies to account for the effects of climate change.

Program 2. Develop a carbon cost equivalency for all processes, materials and equipment used in construction. This carbon cost shall be considered in the granting of building permits and in

the green certification program. (For example, depending on the type of cement used, production of 1 ton of cement produces about 1 ton of greenhouse gases. A federal appeals court recently ruled that a cost of \$36 can be ascribed to 1 ton of greenhouse gases. Stanford claims the cost is actually higher, \$220/ton of GHG but the lower number is a start to costing the effects of construction and other processes on global warming).

Program 3. Plans to mitigate for climate change shall include aquifer storage and recovery, floodplain and stream restoration, flood diversion and storage, and green infrastructure methods.

Fire Protection and Awareness

Need to renumber . There always are policies with these numbers
Under this numbering Policy s2.5 needs a program

Infrastructure

Under water supply and safety add

Water Policy: Plan for water scarcity due to climate change and added demand for water due to population growth by regulating all groundwater use.

Program 1. All groundwater extracted must be metered and charged at market rates.

Program 2. All uncontaminated (does not contain toxic chemicals) groundwater extracted must be used for the benefit of the community. This includes irrigation of parks, streetscape, etc., street cleaning, dust suppression, fire-fighting, etc.

Program 3. De minimis (1(?) million gallons or less) groundwater extracted may be recharged to the aquifer via onsite percolation.

Stormwater management : Look at numbering....Policy S4.7 is followed by S4.1 ??

Telecommunications & Cyber security

Program S4.8.2 after public safety responders add ESVs (Emergency Service Volunteers)

Comments from CAC Member Annette Glanckopf

Natural Environment Comments CAC October 18, 2016

Air Quality

Policy N5.2 **reword** Encourage single occupant vehicle trips and other behaviors to reduce emission from cars.... Too much like big brother

Noise 6.1

Policy N6,1 Too much detail, some of this should be zoning...not comp plan

Policy N6.4: Again too much detail for comp plan. These should be ARB and IR guidelines

Policy N6.4 Program N6.4.4 another program Increase code enforcement and penalties for violations

Transportation- Rail 6.4

Do not agree with Program N6.7.2 re quiet zones. Until we have grade separation, beeping is necessary esp in school zones. I think the duration of noise can be reduced.

Construction Noise 6.5

Code enforcement needs to be enhanced with stronger penalties for violations esp hours of operations

Energy 7

Policy N7.11 Program N7.11.1 This concerns me again big brotherish, Until the cost of gas is comparable to electric most people will not switch. I would also like to point out, that cooking with gas is better than with electric.

Climate change and adaption 8

Need to add policy and programs to encourage residents and businesses to install solar...bulk discounts etc

Note The dewatering group informed council that dewatering adds to sea level rise add

Policy: Mitigate the effects of climate change on the Natural Environment

Program 1. Protect our City's groundwater as a hedge against salt water intrusion due to sea level rise.

Program 2. To minimize floods in areas with high groundwater levels, avoid removal of water retaining soils due to underground construction.

Program 3. Minimize coastal erosion due to sea level rise by protecting our wetlands.